

DASAM GRANTH DISPUTE AND SOLUTION

Mewa Singh
Rtd.Judge,
California-USA

DASAM GRANTH, CONTAINS THE COMPOSITIONS, as under-

JAAP SAHIB, AKAL USTAT, BACHITTER NATAK, CoNTAINING- : " CHANDI CHARITER 1 AND 11, CHANDI DI VAR, GIAN PARBODH, CHAUBIS AVTAR, UP AVTARS ", SHABAD HAZARE, 33 SAWYAS, KHALSA MEHMA, SHASTER NAM Mala PURAN, CHARITRO PAKHYAN, ZAFAR NAMA AND HIKAYATsS.

ALL THESE COMPOSITION ARE INDEPENDENT AND SEPARATE, BUT COMBINED TOGETHER, CALLED- DASAM GRANTH. ADMITTEDLY THIS COMBINATION WAS NOT DONE BY GURU GOBIND SINGH. ITS SUPPORTERS ATTRIBUTE IT TO BHAI MANI SINGH, WHILE ITS opponents falsify it.

Dasam Granth is under dispute from the very inception. There are now three different views about it.

- 1, All its compositions are of Guru Gobind Singh
2. None of its compositions is of Guru Gobind Singh
3. Some of its compositions only are of Guru Gobind Singh, just as,

Jaap Sahib, Akal Ustat-excepting the chapter in adoration of Durga, Shabad Hazare, 33 Sawayas, Khalsa mehma, and Zafar Nama. The rest are of some Hindu poets, which relate to Hindu legends, Gods ,Goddesses and incarnations of Hinduism and are translations of Hindu Purans and scriptures and wiles of women, being in contradiction to Sikh Divine thought. This view is held by the over whelming majority of Sikhs and Sikh scholars and is correct. There might be some interpolations of some Divine verses of the great Guru in the disputed compositions to look like genuine, which needs identification by experts.

There is admittedly Gurbani of Guru Gobind Singh, which was composed by him when he was tenth Sikh Guru before he ordained the Sikhs to accept Guru Granth Sahib as their eternal Guru in perpetuity. He had declared that it was revealed as commanded by God , the Almighty. Thus it is Gurbani, though not included in Guru Granth Sahib, just as, Jaap Sahib ,Shabad Hazare, Akal

ustat, excepting one chapter in praise of Durga, and khalsa Mehma. Zafar Nama is also admittedly his composition. These Divine compositions of the great Guru are in praise of, one and only one God, rejecting the Gods and Goddesses of Hinduism and its religious scriptures. Jaap Sahib had become the Bani of Sikh Nit Nem, daily prayers, along with Japji Sahib, in the times of the Tenth Guru, and part of Sikh initiation-Amrit, besides sawyas and chaupai, as prescribed by him. These compositions to be admittedly of the tenth Guru, should not be confused with the controversial compositions of Dasam Granth

The interpolations were made in a clever manner to intermix some Divine compositions of tenth Guru in other compositions, not to be his, to give the impression that the entire composition is of his. The placing of the real compositions of the Guru in Dasam Granth along with the disputed compositions which can not be his, can never be taken to weaken their credibility and neither to confer any credibility to the disputed compositions , not of the great Guru.

Some persons, though very few, in their over anxiety against the compositions in Dasam Granth, which relate to Hindu legends, translations of some portions of Hindu purans, tales of wiles of women etc, being against Sikh Divine thought, allege its total rejection and thereby rejecting the real and admitted Divine compositions of the Tenth Guru , violating the collective decision of Sikh panth as well, as contained in Sikh Rehat Maryada. Similarly some persons also few, in their over anxiety to defend the real Divine compositions of the tenth Guru, allege its total acceptance, emotionally, thereby accepting the controversial compositions, though those are in contradictions to the Divine thought of Sikh religion.

The persons holding these opposite views allege, that their views are to show the highest regards and respect to the tenth Guru, as to give the full reverence to his real Divine compositions, but without taking the correct decision that

which are his real compositions. Both of these views suffer from their own misunderstandings as there are obvious motivated interpolations and it has to be found out that which compositions are of the tenth Guru and which can not be of his. The total rejection or acceptance of dasam granth compositions is not the right approach. More balanced and deep study is needed and not the mere personal whims based upon incomplete knowledge and mere emotions. It is anti Sikh conduct to disregard the real Divine compositions of the tenth Guru, that these are not his, and it is a more anti Sikh conduct to attribute him those compositions, which have been written by other persons and are not his .

The truth has to be sifted out by the Sikh panth itself, to which there is no much difficulty, as any composition in contradiction to the Divine thought of Sikh religion as contained in Guru Granth Sahib, can not be of Guru Gobind Singh, and any translations of the compositions ,written by others can not be his, who had a very high Divine status to utter the word of God to the humanity, as declared by him, and not to do the translations of the compositions of other persons. These two aspects have to be the real and relevant parameter. There is controversy over this Granth from the very beginning. An expert panel may have to be constituted to study this matter thoroughly to facilitate the decision of Sikh panth unitedly without creating any division in the Sikhs. Such a decision should not be prolonged further as it has already been over delayed.

In fact double edged weapon is being used against the Sikhs by their adversaries, which the Sikhs should understand. If they accept all of the compositions of dasam granth to be of the tenth Guru, then it is put forth as evidence to prove Sikh religion as part of Hinduism. It has been so alleged openly by some Hindu fundamentalists that recitation of dasam granth in two Sikh Takhts at Hazur Sahib and patna Sahib, proves that Sikh religion is part of Hinduism as it contains the translations of Hindu scriptures and literature in praise of Hindu Gods, Goddesses and incarnations, the mere reading or hearing of which is alleged to bring emancipation and unity with God, being in total contradiction to Sikh thought on the face of it.

If Sikhs reject all the compositions of dasam granth, then they also reject the Divine compositions of the tenth Guru, as above mentioned, though those are in accordance with the Divine thought of Sikh religion and some are part of Sikh nit nem and Sikh initiation-Amrit ,prescribed by him. They thus will make them totally deprived of the real Bani of their tenth Guru. They will make the Sikh initiation doubtful, themselves, to which Hindu fundamentalists are allergic, the most. They will finish their separate identity themselves, fulfilling the long standing aim of their adversaries.

Sikhs must save them from this double edged weapon. which can only be done by not coming to the net of false propaganda above pointed. They should not create any doubts to the real Bani of their tenth Guru and neither accept the false attribution to him of the compositions ,which are not his. As there stand created different views in Sikhs themselves, behind which there is the active hand of Sikh adversaries, to misrepresent the Divine Sikh thought, and create disunity in Sikhs, on such a made up issue, Sikh panth should take the right decision under the guidance of Guru Granth Sahib in this regard, to be binding upon all Sikhs.

Effective propaganda is being carried out by some Hindu fundamentalists, and organizations, like RSS and their sub groups ,that Sikh religion is a part of Hinduism and that placing of Dasam Granth and its recitation, at Hazur Sahib and Patna Sahib, two Sikh Takhts, establishes it. This is being so alleged as it contains the compositions as to Hindu legends and incarnations and their praises including that of Hindu Goddess Durga as translated from Hindu scriptures and epics, falsely attributed to Guru Gobind Singh, even though Hindu poets like Syam and Ram have stated there in, to be the authors of those compositions, repeatedly , and which are in total contradiction to the Divine thought of Sikh religion and the Divine teaching of Guru Gobind Singh himself. Can there be any logic to ignore the assertions of the poets , named, Syam and Ram, made repeatedly in these compositions, to have written these compositions, and rather to attribute to the tenth Sikh Guru instead, who has a very high Divine status, to reveal the word of God, to the humanity, as declared by him, to utter what He commands him, and being, the tenth Guru of the revealed Sikh religion. The attribution of such translations and ordinary stories to him, obviously undermines that Divine status, and misrepresents the Sikh religion.

Guru Gobind Singh outrightly denounced and rejected the Hindu Gods and incarnations in his Divine declarations-

“You say that God is un conceived and un born, how could He have been
From the womb of kausalya.?(Ram chandra)
If he whom you call krishan were God, why was he subject to death?
Why should God whom ye describe as holy and without enmity have
Driven Arjan’s chariot?
Worship as God Him whose secret none hath known or shall know.”

And 33 sawyas-X111

“Some worship Brahma as God, others point to Shiva as God, some say
That Vishnu is the Lord of the world, and that by worshiping him all
Sins are erased.

Think on this a thousand times, o fool, at the last hour all thy Gods will
Fore sake thee.

Meditate on Him in thy heart who was , is , and ever shall be.”

33 sawyas-XVI

The Divine teachings of Guru Gobind Singh are-

To worship one and only one-God

To understand and act upon Gurbani-the Divine hymns of Sikh Gurus.

To keep the appearance of khalsa.

(puja Akal purkh ki- parchai Shabad ka- didar khalse ka)

He declared- “Whatever God , the Almighty sayth me with His grace, I say to the world.”

Sawyas

His Divine declarations and teachings are the decisive factor to attribute any composition to him, and according to which, no composition can be attributed to him, which accepts, myths and superstitions, praises, and adoration, of any Gods and incarnations of Hinduism, and which is the translation of the compositions, written by other persons. The Divine message of the tenth Guru is very clear that, only one and one God-unborn, formless and self illuminated, is to be worshiped, rejecting the Hindu Gods and incarnations, in totality, with the logic and reasons as contained in his Divine hymns. There are so many such declarations made by him in his Divine compositions. He mentioned the names of the main Hindu Gods and incarnations to denounce them, that God can never come in the human form as incarnations, falsifying the assertions made in these compositions, that God came in the human form through them. His Divine mission to reveal the word of God to the entire mankind, is itself more than sufficient, to falsify his alleged translations of the compositions written by other persons, which is the illogical concoction and rather blasphemous on the face of it. This issue has to be considered under this parameter.

It is not only doubtful, but impossible to attribute him the compositions, accepting the Hindu Gods and incarnations and their praises and adoration, and the translations of Hindu purans and epics, shaster nam mala puran, of which the basis is the Hindu myths and superstitions and more than four hundred of tales of wiles of women, most of which are against the Sikh norms, and the hakayats, which can never be part of zafar nama. More so that all these compositions were written by other persons, in total contradiction to his Divine thought. Tenth Guru had no time to waste on such translations and compositions, of no relevance to Sikh religion, from his Divine mission to preach Name of God and truth and complete the last phase of Sikh religion and the hostile attitude of hill chiefs and mughal rule, with whom he remained in battles to protect the basic human right of freedom of religion. No other sort of reasoning or evidence is needed in this regard. The well accepted principle of jurisprudence is applicable in this case , that ‘men may tell lies but the circumstances will never’

The propaganda that he did it, to create bravery in Sikhs and to acquaint them of the history of ancient Indian religions, is on the face of it, false and concocted. Why would he then not give the history of Buddhism, Jainism and Islam, besides other religious systems, and confine to only Hindu Gods and incarnations and their adoration, who were openly denounced and rejected by him.? Why would he not narrate the history of Guru Nanak, founder of Sikh religion and other Sikh Gurus, and the bravery and heroism of Sikhs from the times of sixth Guru? If he was to do so. He rather very clearly declared that he infused the spirit of bravery in Sikhs, making them the lions, by imparting to them, his Divine knowledge and Sikh initiation of Amrit- khande de pahul, for which they were already well known. In fact all the ancient Indian religions have been discussed in Guru Granth Sahib and there was no such further need. Name of God has been held to be above all the religions, and that most of which neither preaching nor reaching the reality of God.

The end messages of the writers, in their compositions, reflect their views and are very relevant and rather the decisive factor, to find out their ideologies, and to identify them. The messages in the disputed compositions of dasam granth are in total contradiction to the Divine message of the tenth Guru, mentioned above . It can leave no doubt to their identities, to be the Hindus, devotees

of Durga, Hindu Goddess, having belief in the Hindu incarnations and its myths and superstitions, to such an extent, as to allege that the mere hearing or reading of these compositions would bring emancipation and unity with God , besides all the worldly gains, which are in total contradiction to the Divine thought of Guru Gobind Singh as contained in his Divine compositions and to that of the other Sikh Gurus as contained in Guru Granth Sahib, to which no other evidence is needed. These Hindu poets have repeatedly mentioned their names in these compositions, to be the scribes, as, Syam and Ram. Still, to attribute these compositions to the tenth Guru, is to cross all the limits of logic.

Chandi charitar 1 and 11 and chandi di var, are the translations of markande puran, written by rishi markande, in admiration and praise of Hindu Goddess Durga. It has been recorded in the last stanzas of cc1 that, ‘ there is no other Granth equal to it and translated it from Sanskrit in simple language and Durga will fulfill

so the poet has

his aim for which he has so done and that whosoever will read it to fulfill any of his aims and ambitions, that will be fulfilled. So praise and praise Durga.'

In the last stanzas of cc11, it has been recorded that, 'whosoever will read it, will get lots of wealth and whosoever remembers and praises Durga in the early hours daily will get emancipation and unite with God and end the cycle of birth and death.'

In the last stanzas of chandi di var-var Bhagauti ji ki, it has been recorded that, 'whosoever will sing this var of Durga, will get emancipation and will not enter again the cycle of birth and death.'

In the last stanzas of Gyan parbodh, it has been recorded that 'Durga collected numerous persons from world over and they were cut to pieces and burnt them by reading loudly the Ved mantras, called Hom.' Only her blind devotee could praise her. It also falsifies the assertion put forth by some persons that Durga -Bhagauti was meant to be the Divine power-shakti of God and not the Hindu goddess, by the tenth Guru.

In chaubis Avtar, a very long composition, covering about one half of dasam granth, relating to 24 incarnations of Hinduism, being the translations of, Bhagwat puran, epics of Ramayan and maha bharat, it has been recorded in the very beginning in the first stanza that, 'Syam poet has written it', and it has been so repeated in most of the verses, while in some, name of Ram poet has been recorded. In the next stanza it has been recorded that when the number of persons who commit excesses on the masses is increased then 'God himself comes in the human form', called His incarnations. First such incarnation has been recorded to be Machh-big fish, second- kachhu-tortoise, third and fourth-nar-narayan, and so on, while tenth- Brahma, eleventh- Shiva, thirteenth and fourteenth=Vishnu, eighteenth- sun, nineteenth- moon, twentieth- Ram, hero of ramayan and twenty first- Krishna, hero of maha bharat and twety fourth is the future Avtar- nehclanki.

In the chapter of Ram Avtar, it has been stated in the 6th stanza that the poet is writing from his intellect and if there is any wrong then the poets may correct it, which shows him to be the ordinary poet. In the last stanzas it has been recorded that 'whosoever sings and hears this discourse of Ram, Avtar of Vishnu, no pain or sin ever come close to him, and, he will get the benefits of Vishnu bhagti, and no evil will ever touch him.'

In the chapter of krishna Avtar, in the beginning, it has been recorded that the poet (Syam) will narrate the discourse of krishna Avtar of Vishnu as contained in the 10th chapter of, Bhagwat puran. In the next stanzas prayer has been made by the poet for the 'blessings of Durga, the Hindu Goddess that he can write this granth only under her kindness and blessings.' The poet has repeatedly recorded his name as 'Syam poet' in the verses. In the last stanzas of this lengthy composition, it has been recorded that 'whosoever hears this discourse of krishna Avtar, will be relieved of all of his pains and get erased all of his sins.' Syam poet further reiterates that whosoever sings the praises of krishna as given herein, he will get all the wordly gains and emancipation as well, to be not born again.'

In the long composition of the 24th future Avtar- neh clanki,.it is recorded that this Vishnu Avtar will appear when the evils and sins of kalyug ,will cross all its limits and then again Satyug will start. A horrible war has been described between the forces of this Avtar and his opponents with the ultimate victory to him. Durga has been shown laughing and Shiva dancing in praises of his victory, ensuring their presence for all the times, to bless other Avtars. Kalki Avtar is professed to rule over the world for one million and twenty five thousand years, with all the myths and superstitions of Hinduism.

The next composition relates to up- avtars-deputies , of Brahma and Shiva, after the discourse of twenty four Avtars of Vishnu. The seven up- Avtars of Brahma have been recorded to be = rishi Balmik, rishi kayshap, rishi suker, rishi Bharabparast. Rishi ved vyas, 6 rishis and kali dass. While two of Shiva are=Datta Tiria and his 24 gurus and Paras Nath. It contains all the myth and superstition of Hinduism.

All these compositions are part of, Bachittar natak. These praise and preach, the Gods, Goddesses and incarnations of God of Hinduism in a compact manner, to be the translations of Hindu scriptures, with all its myths and superstitions, openly denounced and rejected by Guru Gobind Singh and all other Sikh Gurus. By no stretch of imagination these can be attributed to the tenth Sikh Guru, where in, the poet who had written it, clearly stated that,

'Durga will fulfill his aims for which he had written it, and that by mere reading it, she will fulfill the ambitions of the reader, and that

he had written it under the blessings of Durga, so hail-hail to Durga.’
 Where in it has been recorded that,
 ‘whosoever will hear and sing these Hindu discourses, will get all the worldly
 gains and the emancipation and unity with God-not to come to the cycle of
 birth and death.’
 Where in it has been recorded that,
 ‘the wrongs of the poet, where ever noticed may be corrected by other poets,
 being an ordinary poet.’
 where in the name of the poet has been recorded to be
 ‘.Syam’, .repeatedly in most of the verses and of Ram in some verses.’
 where in it has been recorded that,
 ‘ God comes in the human form as incarnations of Hinduism.’

From the perusal of these disputed compositions, it is very clear that unflinching faith in Durga, the Hindu goddess has been stressed with her repeated praises, adoration, and for her blessings, from the beginning to the end, besides the mentioning of the name of the writer, in most of the verses as, Syam, and in some as , Ram, while contradicting all the basic doctrines of Sikhism.

There can be no scope of any doubt that the poets, authors of these compositions are the devotees of Durga, believing in Hindu incarnations. Both of these poets were in the list of 52 poets of the darbar of tenth Guru, Syam at number 13, while Ram at 49, as recorded by Bhai Kahan Singh, in -Gurmat martand If these poets have written, and stated, something, somewhere, in their compositions, which does not violate the Sikh Divine thought, it is but natural, as they might have imbibed some principles of Sikh religion , from the great Guru, to exhibit it. Even some interpolations and intermixing of some Divine Hymns of the tenth Guru might have been made to look like genuine, to deceive the Sikhs, to which some Sikhs did fall in the net.

A ridiculous reasoning is given, to which some Sikhs , not aware of Sikh historical perspectives, also became the victims of misunderstanding, that perhaps the tenth Guru translated these Hindu compositions to create the spirit of bravery and heroism in Sikhs. Sikhs had already established a very high spirit of bravery and heroism, much earlier to these compositions, in the battles against mughal armies from the times of their 6th Guru and in the times of tenth Guru, for which the source is-‘ Name of God, Gurbani, faith in God, in Sikh Gurus and in Sikh religion, besides, Sikh initiation–Amrit and Sikh history.’ These Hindu scriptures, Hindu incarnations and legends could not create the spirit of bravery in those, who believed them the most, and were crushed by a few invaders and remained in their slavery for several centuries, to which history is the witness. How could these be of any help to the brave Sikhs in this regard. The real confrontations with the unjust and brutal forces for the sake of ensuring basic human rights, maintaining the moral and ethical values, under the Divine teachings and direct guidance of Sikh Gurus, which happened with Sikhs, can only infuse the spirit of bravery and not the imaginary myths and superstitions.

No Sikh warrior ever knew or had gone through these compositions, the language of which can only be read and understood by the scholars. Even now only few Sikhs know about these compositions, which is only confined to some Sikh scholars and those who read their writings and to some traditional Sikh organization leaders, out of whom only a few might have gone through it, but without having clear understanding of it. Those Sikhs who come in the net of such a false propaganda of bravery, should have their own self introspection that what spirit of bravery they have got from these compositions, and how they have exhibited it. Are they not under mining the Divine teachings of Sikh Gurus, which are known world over, to create the highest sense of bravery in Sikhs and the high spirits, even in times of adversity. Are they not ignoring the declarations of their tenth Guru that his Divine knowledge and Sikh initiation of Amrit, enhanced the spirit of bravery in them. They should be also aware of the directions to them , of Guru Gobind Singh, to never adore Hindu Gods and incarnations.

Max Arthur Macauliff, who was holding a very high post of Divisional judge in punjab, and resigned it, to author ‘The Sikh religion’ in 6 volumes, published in 1909, by oxford university, London, after the research for several years and with the consultations and the approval of the eminent Sikh scholars, has stated that Guru Gobind Singh instructed the Sikhs On Baisakhi 1699,at the time of creation of Khalsa, that-

“Let none pay heed to the ganges and other places of pilgrimage,
 Which are spoken with reverence in the Shastras, or adore incarnations
 Such as, Ram, Krishan, Brahma and Durga, but believe in Guru Nanak
 And the other Sikh Gurus.” Page-94, vol. 5

He has stated the reaction of fundamentalist Hindus, to his declaration, that,

“The learned men among the Hindus preach of Ram, Krishan, and other
 Incarnations recorded in Purans and adhere to the ancient religions, and say,
 Brothers this Khalsa is a new-fangled institution for which we have

He further has stated as to the remarks, Guru Gobind Singh made, when the hill chiefs had come to have discussion with him, that,

“I am intensely concerned for your fallen state. Are you not ashamed to
Call yourselves Rajputs when the musalmans seize your wives and daughters
Before your eyes. Your temples have been demolished and mosques built on
Their sites, and many of your faith have been forcibly converted to Islam. If
You still possess a trace of bravery and the ancient spirit of your race, then listen
To my advice, embrace the Khalsa religion, and gird up your loins to elevate the
condition of your country. Upon this the rajas took their departure without
proposal to substitute his Khalsa for Indian existing religious systems.”
P.100-101

He also stated about other directions, made to the Sikhs by Guru Gobind Singh, that,

“I have made you really tigers, and not merely given you their garb, and it is
For you not to resume your caste habiliments. As I have raised you from a lowly
To a lofty position by imparting to you spiritual knowledge, so if you revert to
Evil ways and Hindu superstitions, from which I have delivered you, your last
Condition shall be worse than your first, for then there will be no hope of your
Amendment.”
P.102

And

“Khalsa can now only be maintained as a nation by bravery and skill in arms.
Therefore I now institute the custom of baptism by water stirred with a dagger,
And change my followers from Sikhs to Singhs or lions. They who accept the
Nectar of the pahul, shall be changed before your very eyes from jackals in to lions, and shall obtain empire
in the world and bliss hereafter.” P.93

Bhai Gian Singh in “panth parkash-chapter 25” stated that Guru gobind Singh had declared-

“I require not her (Durga) blessings or curses. I am son of the immortal, who is
The king of gods and men, who controls millions of worlds, who is omnipotent,
Who cherishes me, and I have no need to adore gods or goddesses.”

Guru Gobind Singh, declared in the zafar nama-letter of victory, to Aurangzeb, mugal emperor-

“I am the destroyer of the turbulent hillmen, since, they are idolaters and I am a breaker of idols.”

In view of these declarations and directions of Guru Gobind Singh to Sikhs, can there be any logic and possibility of his translating the Hindu incarnations, myths and superstitions, for Sikhs, against which, he was so outspoken, that he was breaker of the idols and needs not to adore Hindu gods and incarnations, and rather asked them, never to revert to it and adore the Hindu Gods and incarnations, and to stick to the spiritual knowledge imparted by him, which made them the tigers and to believe in only Guru Nanak and other Sikh Gurus. He made it very clear that the baptism-Sikh initiation, as prescribed by him will make the Sikhs lions from jackals and make them a nation with the spirit of bravery. He admittedly, nowhere told the Sikhs that he has translated the Hindu scriptures relating to Hindu incarnations, for them, to create the spirit of bravery in them, which are rather being used to make the Sikhs as a sect of Hindus, by falsely attributing to the great Guru, to take out their right of a nation, bestowed upon them by tenth Guru, as mentioned above. Sikh history is a witness to the fact that Sikh baptism-Amrit, as prescribed by the tenth Guru, did enhance the spirit of bravery in the Sikhs and made them the true lions, establishing their Sikh empire by crushing the mughals and afgan invaders.

In dasam granth the composition relating to krishan Avtar, was written in 1745 Bk, corresponding to 1688 AD, as recorded in its last stanzas, while that of Ram Avtar was written in 1755 Bk, corresponding to 1698 AD, after 10 years, as recorded in its last stanzas, though krishan Avtar is 21st Avtar and Ram is 20th Avtar. It establishes without any shadow of doubt that the Hindu poets had written these compositions separately and these were clubbed together later on, showing to be in serial wise, the composition as to Ram Avtar to be written earlier than that of krishan Avtar, though it was written ten years after that of krishan avtar. If Guru Gobind Singh had thought of writing as to 24 Avtars

,he could never write about krishan Avtar, 21st Avtar earlier to 20th Ram Avtar and that too ten years earlier. These dates of the writings of these compositions are itself more than sufficient to totally falsify the attribution to the tenth Guru. The forgeries and interpolations can never be perfect and leave their traces to be discovered.

The next disputed composition of Dasam Granth is- shastar nam mala puran. Its name itself shows that it is also from purans of Hinduism. It is also a long composition with all the Hindu myths and superstitions. In the beginning, the names of all the Hindu incarnations have been given, that you are, machh, kachh, narah, bawan, nar Singh, boudh, ram, krishna, vishnu and brahma. It gives the description of the weapons in the Hindu mythical manner. It is obviously the work of some Hindu poet and can never be attributed to Guru Gobind Singh. In it, even the words 'Mukh wak Patshahi Dasveen', have not been written. There is no explanation that why it has been included in dasam granth and attributed to the great Guru.

The other disputed composition of Dasam granth is-charitro pakhyan, which is a very long composition, covering about one third of this granth. Hindu poet, Ram, has mentioned there in repeatedly, to have written this composition. In chariter 18, he has stated, that he had written the chariter 17, with devotion and his mind is now set to write such other stories-chariters. These have been alleged to be the discourse between a king and his minister, mostly the minister telling it to the king. It contains 404 stories, out of which most relate to the deceptive nature and tales of wiles of women. The stories had been already written by ordinary writers, and some are known to every one, as folk tales and involving love affairs, just as, Heer- ranjha, Sohni- mahiwal, Sassi -punnu, mirza- sahiban. Some are of Hindu legends, just as, Daropadi -Arjan, parbati -vishnu, Dashrath -kakai, etc. It is ridiculous to attribute such hundreds of stories to the great Guru. The motivation appears to be to under mine his highest Divine status.

Its first chapter contains the praises of Hindu Goddess Durga and the poet has sought her blessings to describe the stories. In the last stanzas it has been stated that it is due to the kindness and blessings of Durga - jag mata , that the poet has been able to complete this composition. It has also been asserted that who so ever will hear or recite these compositions, no pain or fear will come close to him and that if any dumb person will hear it, he will start speaking.

In some of the compositions, intoxicants like bhang and liquor have been advocated , depicting the most objectionable sexual behaviour. and obscenity. SGPC with the approval of Akal Takhat, in its letter 36672 of Aug 3, 1973 declared that, charitro pakhyan is work of some Hindu poet and can never be of tenth Sikh Guru. To attribute these stories to the great Guru is on the face of it, the worst type of mischief and blasphemy .

A ridiculous reasoning is given by some persons that these stories have been compiled to make the men aware of deceptive tricks of women, which is the most insulting to them, who have the great honor in the society, particularly in Sikh religion, where in, it has been declared that-every one is born from the women including the kings, then why to degrade them. Those Sikhs who become the victims of such a false propaganda, should have their self introspections that whether any of them had ever come in to the grip of any deceptive woman and any of these stories came to their help or it was a wastage of their time to go through them. In the presence of the Divine teachings of Guru Granth Sahib, there can be no need of any other scripture or sermons on any subject, what to say of such folk tales of Hindu myths and superstitions, against the Sikh norms. Utilizing the time to recite Gurbani and meditation in Name of God, is the teaching of Sikh religion, to attain the Sikh aim of life, to get unity with God, for which the human life has been provided, other works being in vain, except, reciting Name of God in the company of holy persons.

To waste time on such stories is not in accordance with the edicts of Sikh religion, being rather the obvious distraction from the Divine Sikh way of life, though for some others it may be an entertainment to while away the time. The Divine teachings of Guru Gobind Singh are very clear to always meditate Name of God and recite Gurbani to get His grace to unite with the creator. He nowhere instructed the Sikhs that he has translated such stories for them to be aware of deceptive tricks of women. By hearing the Name of God, one can know the secrets of earth, space, worlds and nether worlds, the deceptive tricks of a woman is too small a thing. More over all the deceptions and working of the human mind can never be covered by such hundreds of stories as it works in different ways in different situations. These may be for the entertainment for those minds , who have no specific mission of life and not for Sikhs, who have to occupy their minds to do the continuous remembrance of God, the Almighty, to unite with Him in this human life.

The translations of such stories, if attributed to the tenth Divine Guru, would obviously harm and undermine his highest Divine status to reveal word of God to humanity and misrepresent his holy mission and of other Sikh Gurus. In fact the relevant question for consideration is that whether such stories and translations , can be ever, attributed to Guru Gobind Singh ,whose holy mission was to preach Name of God and Divine truth, and to complete the final phase of Sikh religion, in those times of hostile brutal regime, and it is not as to the messages of these stories, as some other writers can also write compositions with good messages, if depicted in some stories, though several violate the principles of Sikh religion. No Sikh Guru had based any of his Divine composition on any scripture of any other religion even, as it was the direct revelation of God through them, as declared by all of them, including the tenth Guru. How can the translations of the compositions and stories of other ordinary persons can be attributed to the tenth Guru, which rather amounts to blasphemy

The last composition of dasam granth is of Hakayats, attached with, zafar nama, the letter of victory, sent by Guru Gobind Singh to Aurangzeb. These are stories written in persian, some of which promote the use of intoxicants, like bhang and liquor. It is unbelievable that such like stories will be attached with, zafar nama, which is a self contained letter, providing all the relevant details, of the excesses and deceptions of the mughal emperor, and Guru's faith in God and obedience to His Will. He rather had no time to waste to even hear such useless stories. These stories can never be attributed to Guru Gobind Singh and rather appear to be motivated to under mine Zafar nama and his highest spirit, depicted in those times of adversity, and may also amount to blasphemy.

These compositions as contained in Dasam granth and briefly discussed above, are in total contradiction to the Divine teachings of Guru Gobind Singh as contained in his own Divine compositions, and of other Sikh Gurus as contained in Guru Granth Sahib, where in only the Name of God-one and only one- formless, unborn and self illuminated, to be meditated, and to always live in His Will, can bring emancipation and unity with God-not to be born again; where in all the Hindu legends, Gods and Goddesses and incarnations and Hindu scriptures have been denounced and rejected, and that God never comes in human form., where in it has been declared that, the mere recital of the scriptures of Hinduism-Vedas, purans -Shastras or of other religions, can never bring emancipation.

The end messages of the poets in these compositions, as mentioned above, that their mere readings will bring all the worldly gains and emancipation and unity with God, and that these could be written only due to the blessings of Durga, can leave no doubt to the identity of the poets to be the ordinary Hindu poets, Devotees of Durga, Hindu Goddess and having faith in Hindu Gods and incarnations, who have been outrightly rejected by Guru Gobind Singh and other Sikh Gurus. Syam and Ram are the authors of these compositions, as repeatedly mentioned by them in these compositions.

Still, to get rid of these poets, to make the dishonest glaring allegation, that the tenth Guru had these pen names as poet, is crossing all the limits of logic, falsehood and misrepresentations. Had he used any such pen name in his admitted Divine compositions? Was he an ordinary poet to use the hidden pen names and do the translations of Hindu purans, outrightly rejected by him, and not the Divine guide for humanity of the highest status for the present age, to reveal the word of God.? Can there be any more illogical and senseless allegation than it, amounting to blasphemy?

Guru Gobind Singh, as declared by him in his Divine hymns and having the same Divine spirit of Guru Nanak, revealed the message of God to the humanity as commanded by Him. He has the highest spiritual and Divine status. He was not to do the translations of Hindu legends, epics, and of Hindu incarnations, as given in Hindu Purans, full of myths and superstitions, which he and other Sikh Gurus denounced and rejected openly, and to write the tales of the wiles of women, the stories of which had already been written by different writers, which mostly violate the Sikh norms. As rightly stated by the eminent scholar of religions, Duncan Greenles, in , ' Gospal of Guru Granth Sahib', at page xxxvii-

"The views of Sikh Gurus welled up from the deeps of inspiration, in their own hearts
And owed little or nothing to what they received from others, either through books And through their words."

Thus Guru Gobind Singh can never be connected with the translations of the compositions written by other persons as he was to reveal the Divine message of God to the entire mankind. The attribution of these disputed compositions to him, is on the face of it, false and blasphemous, with the motivation to undermine his highest Divine status, besides introducing in Sikh religion the same superstitions, Gods and incarnations of Hinduism, which had been denounced openly by Sikh Gurus.

Sikh Gurus rejected all the scriptures of Hinduism and declared that they do not preach or reach the reality of God. Guru Nanak, founder of Sikh religion, proclaimed-

"Vedas speak of and interpret God but know not his limit; Six are
the creeds of Shastras but no one merges in God through them" {GGS-148
And,

"Eighteen Purans and four Vedas do not know God's secrets" {GGS-355
And,

"Shastras and Vedas keep man bound to three modes of materialism,
and he does the blind deeds" {GGS 1126}.

Guru Amar Das, the third Sikh Guru rejected the religious scriptures of Hindus, remarking-

"Hindus recite Simirties, Shastras and Vedas but deluded by doubt
they understand not the truth and reality; without following the

divine thought of Gurbani, man understands not reality and obtains
no peace, misery after misery he earns. "{GGS 113}

Guru Arjan Dev, 5th Sikh Guru rejected the Hindu Scriptures-

"There are many Samirites and Shastras which I have thoroughly
studied; but none of them reaches or preaches the invaluable name of
God" {Sukhmani Sahib}

Sikh Gurus rejected all the Gods and incarnations of Hinduism. Guru Nanak, founder Of Sikh religion,
proclaimed-

Brahama indulged in ego and he under stood not the reality
Of God. GGS-224

And
Brahma, Vishnu and Shiva, are decease inflicted, as afflicted the
whole world. They only who realize God and reflect on
Guru's word are emancipated. GGS-1127

And
God has no form, no color, and no features. Through the true
Name He becomes manifest. GGS-697

Guru Amar Dass, third Sikh Guru rejected Gods of Hinduism-

Brahma, Vishnu and Maha dev-shiva remained entangled in three
qualities of maya-materialism and attachment. GGS-852

Guru Ram Dass , fourth Sikh Guru declared-

Brahma, Vishnu and Shiva remained entangled in materialism and
attachment. They remembered not God, the creator. Only
Guru ward understands the Supreme being. GGS-735

Guru Arjan Dev, fifth Sikh Guru declared-

Brahma , Vishnu and Shiva were under worldly attachments.
Only Guru ward remembers Name of God. GGS-394

Guru Gobind Singh rejected Hindu Gods and incarnations and scriptures-

Brahma , Vishnu and Shiva were to be entangled in noose
Of death. Akal ustat
And
Why call Shiva God and why call Brahma God. God is not
Ram Chandra or Krishna or Vishnu, whom ye suppose to be
The lords of the world..Sukhdev, prasar and Vyas erred in
abandoning the one God and worshipping many Gods. All
Have set up false religions. I in every way, believe that there
Is but one God. Xv-sawya of 33
and

"Ram, Rahim, Puran and Quran have put several thoughts but I accept none of them; Samirities, Shastras
and Vedas describe several secrets but I recognize none of them" {Sawayas }

These divine proclamations of Sikh Gurus obviously establish that they had no belief in Hinduism and that their religion
is separate and independent of Hinduism. Sikh Gurus had out rightly rejected the Hindu Gods and their incarnations, the
Hindu religious scriptures, the Hindu rites and rituals, and the Hindu caste and creed system. Sikh Gurus rather
presented their independent and separate universal revealed religion for the entire mankind of the present age, which
satisfies the
developed scientific and juristic mind of today. Guru Gobind Singh is very vocal to denounce and reject Hindu Gods
and incarnations.

Attribution of these compositions of dasam granth, to the tenth Sikh Guru is thus absolutely false, amounting to blasphemy. By such conspiracies and falsehood, Sikh religion can not be made to be part of Hinduism. All the eminent scholars of world religions have declared Sikh religion to be an independent and separate religion like other world religions and nothing to do with Hinduism, rejecting the disputed compositions, that these can never be of tenth Guru.

The eminent American scholar of world religion, HL Bradshaw commented,

"The Sikh faith is the universal religion of the present space age. The Sikh religion is truly the answer to the problems of the modern man" {Sikhism-Sikh Review, Calcutta}.

The eminent British Scholar Max Arthur Macauliffe stated,

"It would be difficult to point to a religion of greater originality or to a more comprehensive ethical system than Sikh religion" (The Sikh religion)

Duncan Greenles, the eminent scholar stated,

"Sikhism is no disguised Hindu sect. It is distinct religion like other great religions of the world." {Gospel of Guru Granth Sahib, p.216}

Dorothy Field, the eminent scholar, stated,

"Sikhism is a new world separate religion and not reformed sect of Hinduism." {Religion of Sikhs, page 34}

Would it, not be the total misrepresentation of Sikh religion and of Guru Gobind Singh, if these disputed compositions of dasam granth are attributed to him falsely, which have been written by the Hindu poets, like, Syam and Ram, devotees of Durga and followers of Hindu religion, believing in Hindu Gods and incarnations, which have been outrightly rejected in Sikh religion by all the Sikh Gurus.

Sikh religion believes in, Fatherhood of God, Brotherhood of mankind and Truthful living. Concept of God is, one and only one, creator of the entire creation, its sustainer and destroyer, without any incarnation, unborn and self illuminated, whose light shines in all. Only His Name is to be meditated to abide in the mind, which burns ego, eliminates vices, inculcates virtues to lead a truthful living in Sikh way of life, obeying the Will of God, the Almighty, awaiting His grace to unite with Him. Truth, Name of God and Pious deeds is the Divine message of Sikhism to convert the human mind from self narrow egoistic tendencies to God tuned of higher consciousness to be activated in all the socio-political affairs throughout the span of life. Divine knowledge is to be obtained from the Divine teachings of Sikhism but it is not the end of the matter as these are to be acted upon in the practical Sikh way of life. It automatically leads to truthful living in Sikh way of life, which is infect way of God.

Fatherhood of God automatically leads to Brotherhood of Mankind, as the same is the creator of the entire creation, the same is His light which shines in all. The Divine message of Sikhism is that human race is one, without any distinctions or discriminations on any ground whatsoever. The religions, faiths, systems, which created divisions and discriminations in mankind were out rightly rejected in Sikhism and effective steps were taken to establish equality in mankind. Sikhism teaches love between man and man as love between man and God and the selfless service to humanity. The eminent scholars of world religions and history have commented that Sikh religion contains no mysteries, myths and superstitions and preaches the remembrance of God in straight and simple manner and the higher moral and ethical values.

Commented, Max Arther Macauliff, British eminent scholar, author of, The Sikh Religion,

"It would be difficult to point to a religion of greater originality or to a more comprehensive ethical system than Sikh religion. The Sikh Scriptures contain sublime truths, the study of which cannot but elevate the reader spiritually, morally and socially. There is no tinge of sectarianism in them. They teach the highest and purest principles that serve to bind the man to man and inspire the believer with an ambition to serve his fellowmen, to sacrifice all and to die for their sake. The Sikh religion compared to other religions presents no mysteries, and embraces an ethical system, such as has never been excelled, it indeed has never been equaled. It offers few points of attack than any other theological system,"

John Clark Archer, the eminent British scholar,

"Sikhism, indeed itself reveals something of what in the last analysis religion is. It is an independent and conspicuous order of its own. The world today needs its message of Peace and Love. Sikhs may stand as symbols and examples of all who search for God and truth."

J.D. Cunningham, author of -History of Sikhs, London, 1849,

“Guru Nanak saved Sikhs from those blunders in which Indian society had been indulging
For centuries and he instructed the Sikhs for the remembrance of God and truthful character
and in this manner he founded the religion, simple, clear cut, independent and
Beyond the false rituals and rites. It was on these basic principles that Guru Gobind Singh
Formed such a nation, which elevated every one politically, and religiously, after doing
With class system.”

Sikh religion, has been commented by the scholars of world religions, to be the universal religion of the present age, capable to solve the problems of the modern age, and that, it is free from all the myths and superstitions, and advocates, the meditation of God-one and only one, unborn and self illuminated, of which some other religions, particularly Hinduism, are full off, in preaching the worship of its numerous Gods and incarnations. Will not these compositions and translations, relating to Hindu Gods, goddesses and incarnations, full of myths and superstitions and their praises and that their recitation only, to bring emancipation and unity with God, if attributed to the tenth Sikh Guru, not totally contradict the Divine teachings of Sikh religion, to be with the same myths, superstitions and ideology of Hinduism, which has been outrightly rejected by the Sikh Gurus.

It is on this very basis that Some Hindu fundamentalists are alleging, that the recitation every day from the Dasam Granth at Patna Sahib and Hazoor Sahib, two of the Sikh Takhts, has proved beyond doubt that Sikhs are part of Hindus. It is a ridiculous assumption, as from the very beginning Sikhs have not accepted all the compositions of the Granth to be of Guru Gobind Singh and rather they had been openly challenging the disputed compositions to be against Sikh divine thought and Dasam Granth, to be not of Guru Gobind Singh. It contains some disputed compositions of legends of Hinduism and translations of Markande Puran, Bhagwat puran and epics of Ramayan and Maha Bharat etc. relating to the twenty four Avatars of Hinduism and some up Avatars, which are in contradiction to Sikh Divine thought as contained in Guru Granth Sahib and in divine hymns of Guru Gobind Singh himself. These compositions are, on the face of it, written by some Hindu poets, which were interpolated by anti Sikh elements in Dasam Granth to create confusion.

Guru Gobind Singh had admittedly not compiled Dasam Granth. It is stated by its supporters to have been brought forth after over two decades of the heavenly abode of Guru Gobind Singh. It is not known with certainty that from whose custody these compositions were obtained and who clubbed together these compositions and who named it as Dasam Granth. There is no evidence worth consideration to connect these compositions with Guru Gobind Singh. Some Hindu poets rather have repeatedly mentioned their names in these compositions to have written it. Sikh were in armed conflict with Moguls at that period and there was thus enough time for such interpolations by the adversaries of Sikh religion to introduce the same Hindu superstitions, Gods and incarnations, in Sikh religion, already rejected by Sikh Gurus. These compositions are the translations of Hindu purans and other scriptures, which falsifies the attribution of such compositions to Guru Gobind Singh. All compositions are in total contradiction to ideology of Sikh religion and of Guru Gobind Singh.

For such interpolations there could be the fundamentalist Hindu brain behind it, as Guru Gobind Singh had warned the Sikhs to always keep their separate identity and not to follow the Brahmanical rites and rituals and neither to adore the Hindu Gods and incarnations. These Sanskrit legends were mostly known to the Brahmanical cult. Sikhism had hurt the self-proclaimed supremacy of this class, the most, and brought to an end the exploitation of the poor innocent masses by this Hindu priestly class in the name of religion. They were thus motivated to bring the Hindu incarnations and superstitions in Sikh religion in the name of Guru Gobind Singh and as such to attribute to him these compositions written by some Hindu poets. The modus operandi was to introduce the words-‘mukh wak patshahi Dasveen’, in the beginning of the compositions, to mislead the Sikhs, as to connect these with tenth Guru and to use the name of Bhai Mani Singh, the martyr, being in the high esteem of Sikhs. Though there is no trace of even a single word, from the great Guru, nor from Bhai Mani Singh in this regard.

There had been a motivated change in its title, from Bachittar Natak, to Dasam Granth, to Dasam Patsha Da Granth, to Sri Guru Granth Sahib with small letters above, Dasam, as to make it rival to Guru Granth Sahib, in which there was no scope of any fabrication, to mislead the Sikhs. There had been even change to the headings of some compositions, just as, Chandi Di Var, to, Var Sri Bhagauti Ji Ki, to mislead the Sikhs. A false propaganda was made to deceive the Sikhs that the tenth Guru had done it, to acquaint the Sikhs of the ancient religious Indian history and to create a spirit of bravery in them and to make them be ware of the deceptive tricks of women. What a ridiculous explanation. Such a propaganda and these systematic changes are not without ulterior motivation and without the hidden hand behind it, to be spread through their agents.

Guru Gobind Singh ordained the Sikhs to accept Guru Granth Sahib as the perpetual eternal Guru of Sikhs, which contains the revealed word of God. and their recitation and Name of God to unite with God. It completely rejects, the myths, the Gods and Goddess of Hinduism and their all the reincarnations and the worship of Idols. The tenth Guru admittedly had never uttered a word for Sikhs that he has also translated the purans as to Hindu Gods and incarnations or the tales of wives of women to go through. On what basis these are being attributed to him. Guru Granth Sahib preaches the Name of God (one and only one, formless, unborn and self illuminated) to be imbued in one's mind and to unite with Him. If any composition violates these fundamentals of Sikhism and praises and adores any of the Hindu Gods, Goddesses or their incarnations, it can never be of any Sikh Guru or even of any true follower of Sikhism. Guru Granth Sahib is such a true guide that it is not at all difficult to come to the true conclusion in this respect. The compositions relating to the praises of Goddess Durga, Ram Chandra or Sri Krishna or any other Hindu God, and that their recitations only, can bring emancipation and unity with God can never be attributed to Guru Gobind Singh.

American scholar Geoffrey Parinder who authored the book, 'World Religions' could find no difficulty to conclude at page 259-

"The Dasam Granth is an eighteenth century collection of miscellaneous works attributed to Guru Gobind Singh. The attribution appears to be accurate in the case of few compositions, but the bulk of the collection, consisting of Hindu legends and tales of the wives of women can not possibly have been his work."

The eminent British scholar, J.D. Cunningham, who remained in India in the British political department for several years and authored, history of Sikhs, published in 1849 A.D, stated in appendix xviii, at pages, 325- 329- giving the details of dasam granth,

"The compositions in dasam granth-jap Sahib, Akal ustat, thirty two sawayas, Shabad hazare, and zafar nama are of Guru Gobind Singh, while, the other compositions are of other persons, mostly by Sayam and Ram, who have

Mentioned their names in most of the verses of those compositions to be their scribes in clear terms."

The British scholar, M.A. Mcauliff, author of, The Sikh religion, has come to this very conclusion-

"What is called the granth of the tenth Guru is only his partially compositions. The great portion of it was written by bards in his employ. The two works Entitled as, chandi charitar, and the, Bhagauti ki war, found in it are abridged Translations by different hands of the durga sapt shati, or seven hundred sloks On the subject of durga, an episode in the 'markande puran' on the contests of The goddess Durga with the demons who had made war on the gods."

And

"The translator's object ,however , is not stated. Whether he imbibed some of The principles of Sikhism or not from the Guru can not be ascertained, but it is Clear that he was largely tinctured with Hinduism."

P.80, vol.5-The Sikh religion

Mcauliff has further stated-

"In the year A, D.1734, while in Amritsar , Bhai Mani Singh, compiled The Compositions and translations of Guru Gobind Singh and of

Bards who were associated with him, The compilation was subsequently Known as the Granth of tenth Guru, though Bhai Mani Singh did not give it that title"

And

"Several intelligent Sikhs were of the opinion, that the tales and translations In the volume, as at present found, ought not to have been included in it, for Many of them are of Hindu origin, others fit not for perusal, and none comparable With the Hymns contained in the Adi Granth."

And

Bhai mani Singh had written the words-The tenth Guru spoke with his holy

Where are those translations of the bards. Obviously, these very disputed compositions, attributed to Guru Gobind Singh, falsely, by interpolation of the words- Mukh wak patshahi Dasween. Who attributed it to him, and gave it the title of dasam Granth - granth of the tenth Guru, by clubbing together, though many of them are of Hindu origin? Obviously, same brain, which is now using it as evidence to prove Sikh religion to be part of Hinduism. It is also very clear that the Sikhs had been alleging from the beginning that these disputed compositions ought not to have been included in Dasam granth for the reasons above mentioned., but they could not take the decision in this regard, perhaps due to their struggles for , freedom and identity, and to avoid any disunity on this issue.

Some Sikh scholars held their discussions , on matters, not so relevant, nor in the right perspective, neither on the real issues involved, to support dasam granth, though these American and Britisher scholars have exhibited their correct understanding and clarity. Has any of the Sikh scholars, who accept the entire dasam granth to be of Guru Gobind Singh, been able to visualize the assertions of those, who allege Sikh religion to be part of Hinduism on the ground of its placing and recitations in two Sikh Takhts or even considered and discussed this aspect in their writings and that the disputed compositions to be in total contradiction to the Divine thought of Sikh religion, besides the highest Divine status of the tenth Guru to reveal the word of God and not to do the translations of the compositions of others, before coming to their conclusions. Has any of them given any consideration and explanation, worth consideration that why the tenth Guru would waste his precious time on such translations, regarding the Gods and incarnations of Hinduism, already denounced and rejected by him, the most, which was to be devoted to his holy mission and to preach Sikh religion. What value can such so called scholarly writings acquire in the absence of the consideration and discussion of the real relevant issues involved and of their far reaching consequences against Sikhs and Sikh religion. Why these relevant issues have been ignored by those who rely upon such writings. Does it not support the comments about Sikhs that they can be deceived very easily. Though due to their simplicity, sincerity and honesty. But they stood deceived and defrauded at the crucial stages of their history and suffered the most from the hands of those who deceived and committed fraud on them, whom they had believed to be their well wishers.

Guru Gobind Singh in his divine hymns totally rejected all Hindu Gods, scriptures, rites and rituals and the Hindu Caste System. Instead, he created a separate Sikh code of conduct and identity to complete the formation of Sikh nation. The Sikh nation by his ordinances, was made so independent and powerful that it established a sovereign, independent and eminent Sikh empire through out north India. Would it not amount to conceding the Sikhs to be a sect of Hindus and Sikh religion to be a part of Hinduism, if the attribution to the tenth Sikh Guru is accepted as to the disputed compositions, praising and adoring the Hindu superstitions, myths, Gods and incarnations, alleging that the mere hearing of which, can bring emancipation and unity with God, for which ulterior motivations, such attributions have been made, and are portrayed openly as evidence to prove it by some Hindu fundamentalists. Where then the independent revelations of Sikh religion will stand, that it is only by the meditation of one and only one God-formless, unborn and self illuminated, and to remain under His Will, can bring emancipation and unity with God and its distinct Divine thought, which has brought it in the list of five main world religions.

It is a self-deception by those, who want to take advantage of the dishonest attribution and interpolation of the Hindu legends in the Dasam Granth, to prove that Sikh religion is part of Hinduism and the Sikhs should be aware of it. The real compositions of the tenth Guru, rather prove to the otherwise, without any shadow of doubt, that Sikh religion is an independent, separate, and revelatory, world religion with its, distinct identity, religious practices and unique spiritual and Divine doctrines and ideology. In fact it is the tenth Guru's prescribed Sikh initiation- Amrit-pahul, separate identity and the code of conduct, that always stood as a rock to fail the repeated false and the futile exercise to misrepresent Sikhs to be sect of Hindus, time and again. The injunctions of the tenth Guru, made the Sikhs as a nation, as remarked by the eminent scholars of world religions and his very name is being misused to prove them as a sect of Hindus. The supporters of dasam granth have to give it a serious consideration.

Those who are opponents of this Dasam Granth, should admit and accept without any reservations, that the Divine compositions, which are included in Sikh Nit nem , and for the preparation of Amrit-Khande de pahul,, as contained in Sikh Rehat maryada to be of Guru Gobind Singh, are of his. In fact the procedure prescribed by him for Amrit is the same which is now followed. It was not any secret thing and was known to thousands of Sikhs who were present there. Several persons who took the Amrit from Guru Gobind Singh or under his guidance, were the leaders in Sikh struggle and they themselves imparted the Amrit to thousands of Sikhs, and such a process continued uptill now. No one could dare to change it. It is no where even alleged that when, who and why the original prescribed procedure was changed, which is a must to prove, if any change is alleged to the existing procedure. It is a small period of three centuries only.

Some contradictory writings are cited in this regard, which itself shows that those writers knew not the reality and did no research about it, and only followed the stray remarks, either forged or totally ignorant about it. Such contradictory

writings can have no authenticity and have to be ignored There were also the hidden hands behind the fabrications, conspiracies and motivations, to create confusions by the anti Sikh forces, who were motivated to bring in Sikh religion, the same myths, superstitions and the Hindu Gods and incarnations and their worship, rejected by Sikh Gurus and by those elements also, who could never reconcile to the order of Khalsa, Sikh code of conduct, Sikh initiation of Amrit and separate Sikh identity, which are obviously still in existence and active up till now.

The compositions, which are not of the tenth Guru, should not be attributed to him, while his real compositions should be revered as Gurbani. In Dasam granth, only the real and admitted Divine compositions of Guru Gobind Singh should be kept, as above mentioned, and any other as decided by Sikh panth to be his, to have been interpolated and inter mixed elsewhere, for which the deep study is required and particularly Of the first part of Bachitter natak, where in, his past and present life, his mission, commandments of God to him and his battles with hill chiefs and mugal army, have been described in the personal tense. All other compositions should remain separate as these originally were. Bachitter Natak is a separate composition and so are shaster nam mala, charitro pakhyan and Hakayats. In fact all these were clubbed together with the other real compositions of the great Guru without any authority and logic, under the specific motivation, which needs to be undone.

Supporters of the dasam granth allege that it was so done by Bhai Mani Singh after about two decades of the heavenly abode of tenth Guru, but some scholars falsify this version. It has to be considered that why the name of Bhai Mani Singh is dragged in all the anti Sikh compositions, may be of dasam granth or may be Gur bilas patshahi chhevin, etc., wherein attempts have been made to introduce in Sikh religion, and attributing to Sikh Gurus, the same Hindu Gods and incarnations, myths and superstitions, outrightly rejected by them. It might be to give the credibility to those anti Sikh compositions due to the high esteem, he had in Sikhs and his remaining under the direct blessings of Guru Gobind Singh. He might have attempted to search out the compositions of the tenth Guru and the translations and compositions of bards of his darbar, but he never compiled Dasam granth, nor attributed the compositions of other poets to the great Guru.

His alleged beer-manuscript, is itself doubtful. It is stated to be lying at the house of Raja Gulab Singh at Delhi, that some soldier of Sikh army got it during the attack on Multan in 1818 AD, and it was purchased by him. No explanation that who, why and when, took it to Multan and from where, and that in whose custody, it remained in such a long period. Its alleged compilation year 1713AD, is in a different ink and hand and held to be forged, by some scholars, who examined it. For the proof of a document as to its reliability, it must be proved that who is its scribe, when was it written, in whose custody it remained and that there was no opportunity to fabricate it, besides that it is in accordance with the known ideology of the writer in such a case. None of these basic requirements are available and rather there is material to belie it.

Bhai Mani Singh can never be connected with any anti Sikh compositions, which violate the Divine thought of Sikh religion and of Guru Gobind Singh or with any recompiling of Guru Granth Sahib, which was written by him, at the dictation of the tenth Guru at Dam dama Sahib. The compilation of dasam granth by him in 1713 AD., written on it, as alleged, stands falsified from his alleged letter of 1716 AD, itself, wherein it is stated that he is still searching the compositions of the tenth Guru. Is there the need of any other evidence to prove its fabrication. He had not taken any decision on any Sikh panthic affair alone, though he remained at the helm of the Sikh affairs at Harmandir Sahib and Akal Takhat for several years as he was well aware of the Sikh concept of Guru Granth and Guru Panth. How could he alone take such a crucial decision to recompile and change the structure of Guru Granth Sahib and to attribute such anti Sikh compositions to the tenth Guru, being on the face of it, in violation of Sikh Divine teachings and written by some Hindu poets mentioned therein. There were thousands of devoted Sikhs, and accepted devoted Sikh leadership at that time, ready to give supreme sacrifices for Sikh cause in the Sikh struggle in those days. Would any eminent Sikh leader dare to change Guru Granth Sahib and attribute such anti-Sikh compositions to the tenth Guru?

Admittedly Guru Gobind Singh had not compiled dasam granth, and nor he declared any where that he had written these compositions. It was not so done by Bhai Mani Singh, neither it could be so done by him and nor he ever told the Sikhs of doing it. If he had done it, he must have announced it at Harmander Sahib or Akal Takhat, as he was managing these Sikh institutions and not kept it concealed. Still, even if it be assumed, for the sake of argument, that Bhai Mani Singh did it, then the question for determination arises that, What authority Bhai Mani Singh had to do so. Any Sikh, whatever esteem and respect, he may command in Sikhs, can have no right to act as Guru or Sikh panth. Such a panthic decision can not be taken by him as only panth has the right to take such panthic decisions, which has not so far been taken by Sikh panth on this issue. On this very ground, the decisions of the few persons, just like Sodhak committee, can be of no relevance, and neither the individual views of some Sikh scholars, unless accepted by Sikh panth., under the Divine guidance of Guru Granth Sahib. Rightly remarked, the eminent Sikh scholar Bhai Kahan Singh Nabha,

‘The decision of Sikh panth, based on an individual view is against the tenants Established by Guru Gobind Singh. It is required to pass a gurmatta unanimously Just as the fourth beer was rejected. The writings of Dasam granth should have Been separated.’

(Gurmat martand, page 569-70)

And

“ We accept Bhai Mani Singh as a panth rattan and religious hero, but never hesitate To attribute to him the grave mistake to compile dasam granth, which has caused a Great harm to Sikhs and to do so in future as well.”

(Gurmat martand,page 570)

It is interesting to note that all the alleged four main dasam granth beers do not go prior to 19th century. Bhai Mani Singh beer is stated to have been founded in 1818 by a soldier during the attack on Multan. Moti bagh beer is alleged to be given to maharaja Mohinder Singh of patiala, 1862-1896, by an ancestor of Natha Singh. Sangrur beer is alleged by the granthi to be given to Raja of Sangrur by a pathan of Delhi in 1857. Patna beer is opined by the scholars , who examined it to be written in the 19th century. None of these beers is authentic and no evidence to prove the basic requirements, as above mentioned. All these beers are at variance as to their contents, number of verses , topics and headings, which certainly create doubts as to the genuineness. The number of beers are of no relevance, unless the authenticity of the original is proved. There is no such evidence to prove it. Rather the above mentioned stories as to their discovery and custody are itself sufficient to make these to be unauthentic. Giani Gian Singh, the author of-panth parkash, well accepted by the Sikhs, stated rightly,

“ Dasam granth which is now attributed to Guru Gobind Singh, and put forth as such To sikh panth, had no existence even, in his times.”

Though Sikhs have not taken any direct collective decision on dasam granth, but no recognition to it has been given, except to the Divine compositions of Guru Gobind Singh, just as jaap Sahib, sawyas and chaupai in Sikh rehat maryada, making it part of Nit Nem and Sikh initiation- Amrit. It has rather been provided in Sikh rehat maryada that-

“No other book, however holy and readable, is to be installed In a Gurdawara as the holy Guru Granth Sahib is installed.”

It obviously means that dasam granth can not be installed in a Gurdawara, where in only Guru Granth sahib can be installed.

The usual order of services in a Gurdawara has been provided as under-

“The usual order of services performed in a Gurdawara is the Opening of holy Guru Granth Sahib, kirtan, exposition, Gurbani Katha, the Anand, the prayer, the reading of a passage from the Holy Guru Granth Sahib, the distribution of karah pirsad, and dispersal.”

It obviously means that no dasam granth there and no reading of passage from it in Gurdawaras. and

“The exposition of the holy word (Guru Granth Sahib) alone Is allowed in a Gurdawara.”

It means no exposition from dasam granth is allowed in a Gurdawara.

and

“The Amrit ceremony is to be held in the presence of holy Guru Granth Sahib and a passage only from it is to be read.”

It obviously means, no dasam granth can be taken there and no passage from it to be read.

Bhai kahan Singh Nabha, whose interpretations on Gurmat are given due consideration by Sikhs, has stated,

“ Some innocent and ignorant Sikhs use the word , Gur Shabad, to The verses of dasm granth , which is in contradiction to Gurmat.”

(Gurmat martand, page, 415)

In fact all the Sikhs admit that only Guru Granth Sahib is the eternal Sikh Guru in perpetuity as ordained by Guru Gobind Singh. Installation of dasam granth in Gurdawaras is not permissible and neither the reading of passage from it, as it can not be given the status equal to Guru Granth Sahib, besides the open violation of Sikh rehat maryada. Dasam Granth is now titled as- Shri Guru Granth Sahib, the word, Dasam ,written in small lettere above it. Is not its motivation to confuse the Sikhs as to Guru Granth Sahib, clear even now. Which is the hidden hand behind it? Sikhs must know of it and be aware of it, to be not deceived.

As these violations are taking place and some Sikhs accept all the compositions of dasam granth and some reject all its compositions, under their own misunderstandings, a decision should be taken by Sikh panth to its right perspective under the Divine guidance of Guru Granth Sahib in the form of Gurmatta , to be acceptable to all the Sikhs.

The concept of Guru Granth-Guru panth, as ordained by Guru Gobind Singh, be revived, the over looking, of which for a long time has incapacitated the Sikhs to take the correct and the collective decisions as to the Sikh panthic affairs. It has been reiterated in Sikh rehat maryada as well, that all the decisions affecting the Sikh panth should be taken by the panthic committee and the accredited representatives of the panth, form a meeting of the panth, and their decision is called Gurmatta, to be taken in the presence and Divine guidance of Guru Granth Sahib, on the subjects which are calculated to clarify and support the fundamental principles of Sikh religion, such as safeguarding the position of Sikh Gurus and the holy Guru Granth Sahib, the purity of the ritual and the panthic organization. The decisions of the panth are to be inviolable and binding on all Sikhs. These should not violate the Divine teachings of Sikh Gurus and the Divine thought of Guru Granth Sahib and the established Sikh traditions of Sikh religion, which are binding upon Sikhs. The Sikh panthic decisions were taken in this manner at Akal Takhat by the Sikhs during the Sikh struggle in 18th century and they became victorious to wipe out the mughals and Afgan invaders and to establish Sikh empire.

Sikhs are now spread world over and there is now the need of a world Sikh representation of Sikhs, may be named as, Sharomani Sikh panth council, as the Sikh interests are the same every where. It can effectively solve the problems of the Sikhs world over. It can preach Sikh religion in the world, with the co-ordination of all the Sikhs and Sikh organizations, for which Sikhs are being accused not to have discharged their duty to bring the message of Sikh religion, of love and peace, to the notice of the world, needed today. It can make the Sikhs to live in Sikh code of conduct and Sikh way of life, from which they are now drifting away, particularly the Sikh younger generation. It can take the decisions on Sikh affairs unitedly as the involvement of all the Sikh is a must to make the decisions to be acceptable to all Sikhs, in accordance with the Sikh concept of Guru Granth-Guru panth, which are being brought under disputes, day by day.

SGPC, is the creation of Sikh Gurdawaras act 1925, to manage historical Sikh Gurdawaras in punjab, and to preach Sikh religion. It has to function under the provisions of that law. No one can contest its election, who is not a resident of punjab, under the act. Its representation in the world panthic council will be very effective, being the main Sikh representative body, to do the constructive work for the solution of the Sikh problems and to preach Sikh religion in Sikhs and in the world. Akali Dal, which was the exclusive punjab Sikh political party, has now virtually become the punjab regional political party, with the Hindus and muslims, as its members, to give it a secular out look, to meet the requirements of election laws, to contest the assembly and parliamentary elections .It may do so with the Sikh support, as the political Sikh power is only concerned with punjab, where the Sikhs are in majority and that too with the tinge of secularism, as the election laws demand. Thus there has to be a world Sikh representative panthic council ,which will be of great help also to the political Sikh power in punjab, to deal with their issues with the needed courage, capability and honesty of purpose, to achieve Sikh religious and political aims. Delhi Gurdawaras management committee is for historical Gurdawaras at Delhi. Similarly ,are the management committees of Takhats, Hazur Sahib and patna Sahib for those Takhts. These Sikh organizations should take active part in setting up of the world Sikh panth council, without any fear psychosis, which will be of no interference in their functions.

The blue print of the world Sikh panth council, at present, may be, to take the representatives of the organizations, elected by the Sikhs, just as SGPC, management committees of, Delhi Sikh Gurdawaras, Sikh Takhats at Hazoor Sahib, Patna Sahib, other traditional Sikh organizations, world Sikh Gurdawaras management committees, to be divided in, 6 or 7 zones, world over , to represent on the basis of population and any other such Sikh organization elected by the Sikhs. The number of representatives of these organizations may be fixed according to the number of Sikhs , they represent. These representatives may co-opt the distinguished Sikhs known for their services to Sikh panth as fixed, world over, to make it truly representative. This panthic representative council of the Sikhs world over should hold its, periodic meetings, Sikh congregations and other functions

at Akal Takhat , Amritsar and have its secretariate in that complex. The Akal Takhat Jathedar, should be its spokesman and to ensure the compliance of its decisions, to be nominated by it. The authority of Akal Takhat, which is now being eroded, will be restored and its sanctity maintained.

A committee may be set up to sort out the procedural matters to select this panthic council.

Let the first task of this representative panthic council be, to settle the Dasam Granth dispute to the expectations of Sikhs and acceptable to all Sikhs, under the Divine guidance of Guru Granth Sahib.

A Sikh representative meeting may be called at Akal Takhat immediately and it may set up a committee of experts to deeply go through this matter, to discuss it with the persons holding different views, to hold their inter-se discussions, to bring them to the right perspective and then to submit its report ,which may facilitate the right decision to be taken by the Sikh representative panthic council, to be acceptable to all the Sikhs.

The decision of this issue, has to be made under the Divine guidance of Guru Granth Sahib, and any composition,

which violates its Divine teachings can never be of Guru Gobind Singh, who ordained the Sikhs to accept it as the eternal Sikh Guru in perpetuity. The most relevant matters, as established from the facts and circumstances, mentioned above, for consideration, may be-

1. The disputed compositions are in total contradiction with the Divine thought of Sikh religion as contained in Guru Granth Sahib, and the Divine teachings of Guru Gobind Singh, as contained in his real compositions, making the attribution to him impossible

2. These compositions under mine and misrepresent the highest Divine status of the tenth Guru, who was to reveal the word of God to the humanity, as commanded by Him, and not to do the translations of the compositions of other writers, and that too of the tales of wives of women, being against the Sikh norms, and of the Hindu incarnations, openly rejected by him, and by other Sikh Gurus, making the attribution to him impossible.

3. It is the attempt of reintroduction and adoration of Hindu Gods, and incarnations in Sikh religion, by these compositions, which have been outrightly rejected by Sikh Gurus, including the tenth Guru, which will totally misrepresent them and Sikh religion, making attribution to him impossible.

4. The end messages of the poets who recorded these compositions, that whosoever will hear or read these praises and adoration of Hindu incarnations, will get emancipation and unity with God, besides the worldly gains, are in total contradiction with Divine thought of Guru Gobind Singh and that of Sikh religion, that meditation in the name of, one and only one God-unborn, formless and self illuminated, and to live in His will, only can bring emancipation, making the attribution to him impossible.

5. Such messages of the poets of these compositions and that they prayed for the blessings of Durga to write these, and thanked her after the completions, as recorded therein, prove, that they are the devotees of Durga, having belief in Hindu incarnations and religion, making attribution to the Guru impossible.

6. The names of the poets, Syam and Ram, recorded in these compositions repeatedly, to have written these, prove them to be the actual writers of these compositions beyond any shadow of doubt, making the attribution to the Guru impossible.

7. There could be no difficulty to write in the beginning of these compositions, the words, such as 'Mukh wak patshahi Dasveen', by any body, as admittedly not written by the tenth Guru, and so not sufficient to connect it with the tenth Guru, and particularly when these are in contradiction to his Divine teachings

8. Bhai Mani Singh, who had written Guru Granth Sahib on the dictation of the tenth Guru at Dam Dama Sahib, and remained in its service as head granthi at Harmandir Sahib, could never imagine, what to say of recompiling and making changes, in it, which had been bestowed Guru ship.

9. Bhai Mani Singh, who remained under the direct blessings of tenth Guru and gave the supreme sacrifice for Sikh cause, can never attribute these anti Sikh translations and compositions, to him, which are in total contradiction to his Divine status, Divine teachings and the Divine Sikh thought, of which he was well aware of.

10. The allegation of compiling of dasam granth in 1713 A.D., as recorded therein, is falsified by the alleged letter of Bhai Mani Singh, of 1716 A.D., wherein it has been mentioned clearly, that he is still searching for the compositions of tenth Guru, and is sufficient to prove the fabrications and interpolations in this regard.

11. The clubbing of the separate compositions of different writers, with the Banis of the tenth Guru, and attributing all to him, though in total contradiction to his real Banis, and giving it the name of dasam granth, is motivated and unauthorised, as it was neither done by the great Guru and nor by the Sikh panth and needs to be undone by Sikhs.

12. The installation of dasam granth and its recitation in Takhts, Hazur Sahib and Patna Sahib, or in any other Sikh Gurdawara, containing the compositions of some Hindu poets in praise and adoration of Hindu Gods, Goddesses and incarnations, rejected in Sikh religion, are bound to create confusions and misrepresentation, to the Divine teachings of Sikh religion, and are rather openly being used as evidence by Hindu fundamentalists as a proof, that Sikh religion is part of Hinduism, and Sikhs are a sect of Hindus, and needs to be undone.

13. Guru Granth Sahib, Divine teachings of Guru Gobind Singh, Sikh initiation-Amrit, faith in God, in Guru and in Sikh religion, besides Sikh history, had created bravery in Sikhs, who had exhibited a very high spirit of bravery and heroism, since the times of 6th Guru, and there was no need for this purpose of the translations, containing the praises

and adoration of Hindu legends and incarnations, by tenth Guru, as alleged, denounced and rejected by him and all other Sikh Gurus, which created no bravery in those, who believed them the most, and remained under slavery for centuries under few invaders, to which history is the witness.

14. Guru Granth Sahib contains the discussion of all the ancient Indian religions and teaches that Name of God is above all the religions and most of which do not reach or preach the reality of God, and there was no need for the tenth Guru to translate the Hindu scriptures relating to Hindu Gods and incarnations to acquaint the Sikhs in that regard, as alleged, which had been rejected in Sikh religion.

15. The teachings of Guru Granth Sahib are sufficient to lead a truthful living and to be aware of all the evils and deceptions and there could be no need of other scriptures and sermons, what to say of the translation of hundreds of tales of wiles of women, by the tenth Guru, who was to reveal the word of God, and not such translations, some of which violate the Sikh norms and depict obscenity.

16. It is the under minding of the status of Guru Granth Sahib, by installing dasam Granth along with it, and violation of Sikh rehat maryada in this regard, which prohibits it, and needs to be undone, which may prove to be of adverse consequences for Sikh religion.

17. The attribution of the anti Sikh compositions to Guru Gobind Singh, and the totally baseless allegation, that he used the pen names of Syam and Ram as a poet, who were the poets of his darbar, is motivated and blasphemous, requiring urgent action by the Sikhs.

The misguided emotions of some Sikhs and the discussions on extraneous and irrelevant points by some scholars, have created, rather than cleared, confusions on dasam granth. The need is of the open mind with truth finding mission, rising above egoistic tendencies, to give the serious thought and consideration to the Divine dictums of Sikh religion and the relevant matters just as pointed out above, to come to the correct unanimous decision, under the Divine guidance of Guru Granth Sahib. The relevant and decisive factor for the ultimate decision will have to be, that, the compositions, which are obviously contradictory to the Divine teachings of Guru Granth Sahib, the translations of compositions of other writers, and the compositions of other poets, as recorded therein, to be rejected, being not of Guru Gobind Singh and to be no more part of dasam granth, while his real Divine compositions only to remain in dasam granth, to be revered as Gurbani.

If the Sikhs holding different views on this issue do not see to the reason and logic and the Sikh panth does not take the correct decision under the guidance of Guru Granth Sahib, to be binding upon all Sikhs, as discussed above, then they will be helping the cause of anti Sikh forces to create confusions and controversies as to the, Divine Sikh thought, and the division in the Sikhs, on such a made up issue, at this crucial juncture for Sikh unity.

**Mewa Singh
Rtd. Judge
california-USA**